

# Reports of the City Works Committee Meeting held at 7.30pm on Tuesday, 9 February 2016.

---

## **APOLOGIES**

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF LAND**

## **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

### **Pecuniary Interests**

#### **Non Pecuniary – Significant Interests**

#### **Non Pecuniary – Less than Significant Interests**

<b>ITEM</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
1.	<b>TECHNICAL SERVICES</b>	4
1.1	Traffic Committee	4
2.	<b>OPERATIONAL SERVICES</b>	12
	No reports this round	12
3.	<b>ASSETS AND SUPPLY SERVICES</b>	12
3.1	T15/30 Cleaning of Public Toilets and Sporting Ground Amenities	12
3.2	T15/22 WHS Auditing and Consultancy Services	16
3.3	T15/28 Grounds Maintenance at Airds, Claymore, Glenfield, Macquarie Fields and Minto	22
4.	<b>EMERGENCY SERVICES</b>	28
	No reports this round	28
5.	<b>GENERAL BUSINESS</b>	28
22.	<b>CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS</b>	28
22.1	Confidential Report Directors of Companies - City Works	28

---

---

**Minutes of the City Works Committee held on 9 February 2016**

---

**Present**

Councillor F Borg  
Councillor G Brticevic  
Councillor A Chanthivong  
Councillor W Glynn  
Councillor P Lake  
Councillor C Mead  
Director Business Services - Mr M Sewell  
Acting Director Community Services - Mrs J Uluibau  
Director City Works - Mr W Rylands  
Acting Manager Assets and Supply Services - Mr W Miller  
Manager Compliance Services - Mr P Curley  
Acting Manager Customer Service - Ms M James  
Acting Manager Education and Care Services - Ms G Vickers  
Manager Emergency and Facility Management - Mr R Blair  
Manager Executive Services - Mr N Smolonogov  
Manager Healthy Lifestyles - Mr M Berriman  
Manager Human Resources - Mr B Clarence  
Manager Library Services - Mr G White  
Manager Operational Services - Mr A Davies  
Manager Property Services - Mr J Milicic  
Manager Technical Services - Mr K Lynch  
Executive Assistant - Mrs D Taylor

**Apology (Mead/Lake)**

That the apology from Councillor Dobson be received and accepted.

**CARRIED**

**Chairperson**

In the absence of the Chairperson, Councillor Dobson, Councillor Mead was elected to chair the meeting.

**Acknowledgement of Land**

An Acknowledgement of Land was presented by the Chairperson Councillor Mead.

---

## **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Declarations of Interest were made in respect of the following items:

**Pecuniary Interests - Nil**

**Non Pecuniary – Significant Interests - Nil**

**Non Pecuniary – Less than Significant Interests**

Councillor Chanthivong advised that as a member of the NSW State Parliament he will seek legal advice regarding his need to declare an interest on any issues that may potentially involve the NSW State Government. Councillor Chanthivong noted that if issues arise where he considers there may be a perceived conflict necessitating him to declare an interest he will do so and if appropriate leave the room.

**Other Disclosures - Nil**

---

## **1. TECHNICAL SERVICES**

### **1.1 Traffic Committee**

#### **Reporting Officer**

Manager Technical Services

---

#### **Attachments**

Minutes of the Local Traffic Committee Meeting of 10 December 2015 (contained within this report)

#### **Purpose**

To seek Council's endorsement of the recommendations arising from the Local Traffic Committee meeting held on 10 December 2015.

#### **Report**

##### **RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE ON 10 DECEMBER 2015**

##### **Reports Listed for Consideration**

##### **LTC 15/28 2016 Traffic Committee Meeting Dates**

That the information be noted.

##### **LTC 15/29 Delegation of Local Traffic Committee**

That a discussion be held to discuss meeting formats for the 2016 Traffic Committee meetings.

#### **Officer's Recommendation**

That the recommendations of the Local Traffic Committee as detailed in the Minutes of the meeting held on 10 December 2015 be adopted.

#### **Committee's Recommendation: (Glynn/Lake)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

**CARRIED**

---

**Council Meeting 16 February 2016 (Mead/Lake)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

**Council Resolution Minute Number 13**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

---

## **ATTACHMENT 1**



### **LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE MINUTES**

**10 December 2015**

#### **LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE**

Traffic matters related to the functions delegated to councils under the *Transport Administration Act 1988*.

---

## **Minutes Summary**

**ITEM    TITLE**

**LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE MINUTES**

- 1.        ATTENDANCE**
- 2.        APOLOGIES**
- 3.        CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES**
- 4.        BUSINESS ARISING FROM MINUTES**
- 5.        REPORTS LISTED FOR CONSIDERATION**

**LTC 15/28        2016 Traffic Committee Meeting Dates**

**LTC 15/29        Delegation of Local Traffic Committee**

- 6.        LATE ITEMS**

**No reports this round**

- 7.        GENERAL BUSINESS**

**No reports this round**

- 8.        DEFERRED ITEMS**

**No reports this round**

---

---

## **LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE MINUTES**

Traffic matters related to the functions delegated to Councils under the *Transport Administration Act 1988*.

**Minutes of the Local Traffic Committee held on 10 December 2015**

---

### **1. ATTENDANCE**

#### **Campbelltown City Council**

Councillor Paul Lake (Chairperson)  
Manager Technical Services - Mr Kevin Lynch  
Coordinator Traffic and Road Design - Mr Ajay Arora  
Team Leader Traffic Investigation - Mr Frank Sirc  
Administrative Assistant - Mrs Sue Lambert

#### **Roads and Maritime Services**

Nil

#### **Police Representatives**

Senior Constable Maree Davies

#### **Bus Companies**

Interline - Mr Bill East

#### **Representatives of Local Members of Parliament**

Nil

#### **Representatives of Campbelltown Chamber of Commerce**

Ms Anne Parnham

### **Acknowledgement of Land**

An Acknowledgement of Land was presented by the Chairperson Councillor Lake.

### **2. APOLOGIES**

Roads and Maritime Services - Ms Kaye Russell  
Police Representative - Sergeant Marcus Cotton  
Representative of Local Member of Parliament - Mr Ray James  
Busabout - Mr Stephen Burridge

### **3. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES**

The Minutes of the previous meeting held on 12 November were recommended by the City Works committee on 8 December and adopted by Council on 15 December 2015.

### **4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM MINUTES**

No reports this round

---



---

## **5. REPORTS LISTED FOR CONSIDERATION**

### **LTC 15/28                      2016 Traffic Committee Meeting Dates**

Previous Report:            Nil  
Electorate:                    All Electorates  
Author Location:            Traffic and Road Design Unit

---

### **Attachments**

Nil.

### **Background (10/12/2015)**

The Committee are advised that the proposed Traffic Committee meeting dates for 2016 are as follows:

11 February  
10 March  
14 April  
12 May  
16 June  
14 July  
18 August

### **Officer's Recommendation**

That the information be noted.

### **Discussion (10/12/2015)**

The Manager Technical Services advised that the meeting dates only included up to August, due to the Council election in September 2016.

If there are any changes to the meeting dates for 2016 the Committee will discuss further in 2016.

### **Recommendation of Local Traffic Committee**

That the information be noted.

---

---

**LTC 15/29                      Delegation of Local Traffic Committee**

Previous Report:            LTC 15/22  
Electorate:                    All Electorates  
Author Location:            Traffic and Road Design Unit

---

**Attachments**

Nil

**Background (10/12/2015)**

Discussion to be held as to alternate methods to a face to face meeting that could be used to facilitate the Agenda in situations where the Agenda comprised a small number of items that were not complicated.

**Officer's Recommendation**

That a discussion be held to discuss meeting formats for the 2016 Traffic Committee meetings.

**Discussion (10/12/2015)**

As previously discussed at the meeting held on 15 October 2015, if there is a small number of items on the Agenda that were not complicated, an electronic meeting between the Committee representatives would be acceptable.

The RMS representative had previously advised that this arrangement would be acceptable under the delegation of the Local Traffic Committee when Agendas only consist of minor issues a face to face meeting at Council need not be held. Any issues that need to be raised would be discussed prior to the meeting and would be included in the electronic Agenda.

Following discussion it was agreed that the Manager Technical Services discuss the guidelines on delegation with the RMS representative, and a report be presented at the next meeting outlining proposed guidelines to address Traffic Committee items.

The meeting will remain on a monthly cycle and information could be forwarded to the Committee on the upcoming reports.

**Recommendation of Local Traffic Committee**

That the Manager Technical Services discuss the guidelines on delegation with the RMS representative and a report be presented to the next meeting proposing guidelines to address Traffic Committee items.

---

**6. LATE ITEMS**

**No reports this round**

**7. GENERAL BUSINESS**

**No reports this round**

**8. DEFERRED ITEMS**

**No reports this round**

There being no further business the meeting closed at 11.50am.

P Lake  
CHAIRPERSON

---

## **2. OPERATIONAL SERVICES**

**No reports this round**

## **3. ASSETS AND SUPPLY SERVICES**

### **3.1 T15/30 Cleaning of Public Toilets and Sporting Ground Amenities**

#### **Reporting Officer**

Manager Assets and Supply Services and Manager Emergency Management and Community Safety

---

#### **Attachments**

The following confidential attachment has been distributed to Councillors under separate cover as numerous tenderers have indicated that the contents of their tender are commercial-in-confidence:

Evaluation and Pricing Matrix

#### **Purpose**

To advise Council of the tenders received for cleaning of public toilets and sporting ground amenities and recommend that Council accept the tender submitted by The Sparkle Team Pty Ltd t/as TST Property Services.

#### **History**

Council has in place a contract for the cleaning of public toilets and sporting ground amenities which is due to expire. Council continues to require these services and the contract expenditure historically exceeds the legislative threshold of \$150,000, Council invited tenders for a new contract.

#### **Report**

##### **Legislation**

This tender process was conducted in accordance with the *Local Government Act 1993*, the *Local Government (General) Regulation 2005* and Council's Procurement Policy and Procedures.

##### **Contract Expenditure**

Funds for these works are allocated in Council's budget.

---

### **Contract Term**

The term for this contract will be for a period of one year with two options for extension of 12 months each.

### **Advertising of Tenders**

Tenders were advertised in The Sydney Morning Herald, The Macarthur Advertiser and The Macarthur Chronicle in the weeks commencing 26 October and 2 November 2015. Tenders were also advertised on Tenderlink and Council's website. The Ingleburn and Campbelltown Chambers of Commerce and Industry were notified.

### **Tender Document**

Organisations were requested to submit the following information with their tender response:

- company details
- references
- company experience, particularly as they relate to these services
- details of any subcontractors and their experience, particularly as they relate to the services
- details of their corporate structure nominating the personnel proposed to manage this contract
- details of their proposed staffing levels and nominated staff
- details of their proposed staff supervision program
- details of their proposed cleaning methodologies, including equipment, prevention of contamination issues and proposed vehicles
- pricing
- insurances
- environmental practices
- Work Health and Safety management systems
- conflict of interest declaration
- collusive submission declaration
- additional terms of contract, if proposed.

### **Tenders Received**

Tenders closed on Tuesday 24 November 2015. Seven on-time responses were received from the following organisations:

- AFMR Pty Ltd t/as Solo Services Group
  - Northern Contract Cleaning Pty Ltd
  - Shining Knight Facility Services Pty Ltd
  - SKG Pty Ltd
  - The Sparkle Team Pty Ltd t/as TST Property Services
  - The Trustee for the J P Australia Building Maintenance Services Family Trust
  - TJS Services Group Pty Ltd.
-

### **Evaluation Process**

The Evaluation Panel, consisting of officers from Emergency Management and Community Safety and Communications & Marketing evaluated the tenders against the following weighted assessment criteria:

- company experience and subcontracting
- management and nominated staff and staff supervision program
- cleaning proposal
- price
- work health and safety
- environmental commitment.

The Evaluation Panel used Council's standard 0-10 scoring system for all non-pricing criteria with 10 being the highest score.

The Work Health and Safety and Environmental Practices criteria were assessed on the basis of unsatisfactory, satisfactory or exceptional.

The scoring of tendered prices was determined as an annual cost based on a scenario utilising the public toilet frequency and the sample programs provided in Annexure A and B of the RFT.

### **Recommendation of the Evaluation Panel**

The Sparkle Team Pty Ltd t/as TST Property Services provided the best response to Council and is recommended for the provision of cleaning of public toilets and sporting ground amenities as they:

- provided satisfactory details of their company experience, particularly as they relate to the services, confirmed through reference checks
- provided a satisfactory cleaning proposal
- provided satisfactory details of their management, nominated staff and staff supervision program
- tendered the lowest annual price to Council
- provided satisfactory work, health, safety and environmental documentation.

### **Tenders Not Recommended**

AFMR Pty Ltd t/as Solo Services Group, Northern Contract Cleaning Pty Ltd and Shining Knight Facility Services Pty Ltd are not recommended as they tendered a more expensive price to Council. The Evaluation Panel did not consider there to be any advantage to Council for the increased cost.

SKG Pty Ltd is not recommended as they:

- did not provide a satisfactory cleaning proposal
  - did not provide satisfactory details of their management, nominated staff and staff supervision program
  - tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer.
-

The Trustee for the J P Australia Building Maintenance Services Family Trust is not recommended as they:

- did not provide satisfactory details of their company experience
- did not provide a satisfactory cleaning proposal
- did not provide satisfactory details of their management, nominated staff and staff supervision program
- tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer.

TJS Services Group Pty Ltd is not recommended as they:

- did not provide a satisfactory cleaning proposal
- tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer.

### **Assurance of the Process Undertaken**

In accordance with Council's Procurement Procedures, a Tender Review Panel, consisting of members of Council's Executive reviewed the Tender to assure the process was undertaken in a manner that was fair, transparent and resulted in the best value outcome to Council.

### **Management of Proposed Contract**

The Contractor will be subject to contract management and safety reviews throughout the duration of the contract in accordance with Council's contract management requirements.

### **Officer's Recommendation**

1. That Council accept the offer of The Sparkle Team Pty Ltd t/as TST Property Services for the provision of cleaning of public toilets and sporting ground amenities for a period of one year with two options for extension of 12 months each.
2. That the Contract documents be executed under the Common Seal of Council.
3. That the unsuccessful Tenderers be notified of the results of tender process.

### **Committee's Recommendation: (Lake/Borg)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

### **CARRIED**

### **Council Meeting 16 February 2016 (Mead/Lake)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

### **Council Resolution Minute Number 13**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

---

## **3.2 T15/22 WHS Auditing and Consultancy Services**

### **Reporting Officer**

Manager Assets and Supply Services and Manager Governance and Risk

---

### **Attachments**

The following confidential attachment has been distributed to Councillors under separate cover as numerous tenderers have indicated that the contents of their tender are commercial-in-confidence:

Evaluation and Pricing Matrix

### **Purpose**

To advise Council of the tenders received for the provision of work health and safety auditing and consultancy services and recommend that Council accept the tenders submitted by OHS Services Australia Pty Ltd t/a Minerva Consulting Group and Safety Australia Group Pty Ltd t/a Safety Australia Group under a panel contract arrangement.

### **History**

Council had a contract for the provision of work health and safety and workers compensation auditing that has expired. Council officers determined to exclude workers compensation services from the new contract. As the work health and safety auditing and consultancy services historically exceeds the legislative threshold, Council invited tenders for the new contract.

### **Report**

#### **Legislation**

This tender process was conducted in accordance with the *Local Government Act 1993*, the *Local Government (General) Regulation 2005* and Council's Procurement Policy and Procedures.

#### **Contract Expenditure**

Funds for these works are allocated in Council's budget.

#### **Contract Term**

The term for this contract will be for a period of three years with an option for extension of a further 12 months.

---



### **Advertising of Tenders**

Tenders were advertised in The Sydney Morning Herald, The Macarthur Advertiser and The Macarthur Chronicle in the weeks commencing 17 and 24 August 2015. Tenders were also advertised on Tenderlink and Council's website. The Ingleburn and Campbelltown Chambers of Commerce and Industry were notified.

A tender briefing was held on Wednesday 26 August 2015.

### **Tender Document**

Organisations were requested to submit the following information with their tender response:

- company details
- references
- company experience particularly as it relates to audits of council WHS Management systems, consultancy, training, auditing self-insurers and preparation for a self-insurer audit against the WorkCover National WHS Tool and other WHS related services
- details of any subcontractors and their experience, particularly as they relate to WHS auditing and consultancy services
- nominated staff including experience, qualifications and licences including copies and expiry dates
- details of the types of services provided
- pricing
- insurances
- environmental practices
- Work Health and Safety management systems
- conflict of interest declaration
- collusive submission declaration
- additional terms of contract, if proposed.

### **Tenders Received**

Tenders closed on Tuesday 8 September 2015. Twenty two on-time responses were received from the following organisations:

- Alison Jones t/a Information Plus Action Consultants
  - Australian Quality Assurance and Superintendence t/a AQUAS Pty Ltd
  - Australian Health and Safety Services Pty Ltd
  - Beaware Solutions Pty Ltd t/a Safety Solutions Pty NSW
  - Mines Rescue Pty Ltd t/a Coal Mines Technical Services
  - Ferriby Group of Companies Pty Ltd t/a Ferriby Marine Australia
  - InConsult Pty Ltd
  - JTA Health Safety and Noise Specialists Pty Ltd
  - OHS Services Australia Pty Ltd t/a Minerva Consulting Group
  - Greencap-NAA Pty Ltd t/a Noel Arnold & Associates Pty Ltd
  - OSHEM Solutions Pty Ltd
  - Picks Group Pty Ltd
  - QRMC Risk Management Pty Ltd
-

- The Recovre Group Pty Ltd
- Robson Environmental Pty Ltd
- Brown Bird Pty Ltd ATF The Brown Bird Unit Trust t/a Ryan's Recovery Partners
- Safety Australia Group Pty Ltd t/a Safety Australia Group
- Skilled Health Pty Ltd ATF Tran Family Trust t/a Skilled Health Pty Ltd
- StateCover Mutual Ltd
- The Trustee for the P Hibbs Family Trust t/a Hibbs & Associates Pty Ltd
- WCD – Workers' Compensation Solutions Pty Ltd
- Willis Australia Pty Ltd.

### **Evaluation Process**

The Evaluation Panel, consisting of officers from Governance and Risk and Waste and Recycling Services evaluated the tenders against the following weighted assessment criteria:

- experience of the company
- nominated staff
- services
- suitability of standard pricing
- work health and safety
- environmental commitment.

The Evaluation Panel used Council's standard 0-10 scoring system for all non-pricing criteria with 10 being the highest score.

The Work Health and Safety and Environmental Practices criteria were assessed on the basis of unsatisfactory, satisfactory or exceptional.

The scoring of tendered prices was determined on the hourly and daily rate.

### **Short Listing**

The Request for Tender allowed for a short listing process to occur at Council's discretion, excluding a Tender from further consideration at any stage of the tender process if it is:

- a) found not to comply with the Conditions of Tendering
- b) evaluated as not meeting or addressing a criteria
- c) found to be unacceptable in terms of effectiveness against the evaluation criteria
- d) evaluated as representing a greater than acceptable price
- e) found to be presenting unacceptable risk or
- f) evaluated as not achieving a satisfactory standard.

The Tender Evaluation Panel deemed it appropriate to undertake a short listing process based on the Experience of the Company criterion. Tenderers not meeting a satisfactory response on this criterion were excluded from further evaluation.

---

### **Organisations Not Short Listed**

As a result of the short listing process, the following companies are not recommended as they did not detail satisfactory experience in auditing under the WorkCover National Self-Insurers WHS Audit tool in a similar environment:

- Alison Jones t/a Information Plus Action Consultants
- Australian Health and Safety Services Pty Ltd
- Beaware Solutions Pty Ltd t/a Safety Solutions Pty NSW
- Mines Rescue Pty Ltd t/a Coal Mines Technical Services
- Ferriby Group of Companies Pty Ltd t/a Ferriby Marine Australia
- InConsult Pty Ltd
- Picks Group Pty Ltd
- The Recovre Group Pty Ltd
- Robson Environmental Pty Ltd
- Skilled Health Pty Ltd ATF Tran Family Trust t/a Skilled Health Pty Ltd
- The Trustee for the P Hibbs Family Trust t/a Hibbs & Associates Pty Ltd.

### **Short Listed Organisations**

The following companies were shortlisted on the basis that they were deemed to have a satisfactory level of experience:

- Australian Quality Assurance and Superintendence t/a AQUAS Pty Ltd
- JTA Health Safety and Noise Specialists Pty Ltd
- OHS Services Australia Pty Ltd t/a Minerva Consulting Group
- Greencap-NAA Pty Ltd t/a Noel Arnold & Associates Pty Ltd
- OSHM Solutions Pty Ltd
- Brown Bird Pty Ltd ATF The Brown Bird Unit Trust t/a Ryan's Recovery Partners
- QRMC Risk Management Pty Ltd
- Safety Australia Group Pty Ltd t/a Safety Australia Group
- StateCover Mutual Ltd
- WCD – Workers' Compensation Solutions Pty Ltd
- Willis Australia Pty Ltd.

### **Recommendation of the Evaluation Panel**

The Evaluation Panel recommended that Council maintain a panel of two contractors for the WHS auditing and consultancy services to ensure sufficient utilisation of each contractor.

OHS Services Australia Pty Ltd t/a Minerva Consulting Group are recommended under a panel arrangement as they:

- demonstrated considerable experience in the provision of similar works
  - provided satisfactory details of their nominated staff
  - provided satisfactory details of the types of audit services the company can provide
  - tendered a competitive price in both hourly and daily rate
  - provided satisfactory work, health, safety and environmental documentation
  - have provided satisfactory work to Council in the past.
-

Safety Australia Group Pty Ltd t/a Safety Australia Group are recommended under a panel arrangement as they:

- demonstrated considerable experience in the provision of similar works confirmed through satisfactory reference checks
- provided satisfactory details of their nominated staff
- provided satisfactory details of the types of audit services the company can provide
- tendered a competitive price in both hourly and daily rate to Council
- provided satisfactory work, health, safety and environmental documentation.

### **Tenders Not Recommended**

The following tenderers are not recommended as they did not provide as detailed responses to the remaining criteria as the recommended tenderers:

- Australian Quality Assurance and Superintendence t/a AQUAS Pty Ltd
- JTA Health Safety and Noise Specialists Pty Ltd
- Greencap-NAA Pty Ltd t/a Noel Arnold & Associates Pty Ltd
- OSHM Solutions Pty Ltd
- Brown Bird Pty Ltd ATF The Brown Bird Unit Trust t/a Ryan's Recovery Partners
- QRMC Risk Management Pty Ltd
- StateCover Mutual Ltd
- WCD – Workers' Compensation Solutions Pty Ltd
- Willis Australia Pty Ltd.

### **Assurance of the Process Undertaken**

In accordance with Council's Procurement Procedures, a Tender Review Panel, consisting of members of Council's Executive reviewed the Tender to assure the process was undertaken in a manner that was fair, transparent and resulted in the best value outcome to Council.

### **Management of Proposed Contract**

The Contractor will be subject to contract management and safety reviews throughout the duration of the contract in accordance with Council's contract management requirements.

### **Officer's Recommendation**

1. That Council accept the offers of OHS Services Australia Pty Ltd t/a Minerva Consulting Group and Safety Australia Group Pty Ltd t/a Safety Australia Group under a panel arrangement for the provision of WHS auditing and consultancy for a period of three years with an option for extension for a further 12 months.
  2. That the Contract documents be executed under the Common Seal of Council.
  3. That the unsuccessful Tenderers be notified of the results of tender process.
-

**Committee's Recommendation: (Borg/Brticevic)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

**CARRIED**

**Council Meeting 16 February 2016 (Mead/Lake)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

**Council Resolution Minute Number 13**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

---

### **3.3 T15/28 Grounds Maintenance at Airds, Claymore, Glenfield, Macquarie Fields and Minto**

#### **Reporting Officer**

Manager Assets and Supply Services and Manager Operational Services

---

#### **Attachments**

The following confidential attachments have been distributed to Councillors under separate cover as numerous tenderers have indicated that the contents of their tender are commercial-in-confidence:

Evaluation and Pricing Matrix

#### **Purpose**

To advise Council of the tenders received for the provision of grounds maintenance at Airds, Claymore, Glenfield, Macquarie Fields and Minto and recommend that Council accept the tender submitted by a number of organisations across the range of required suburbs as a panel contract arrangement.

#### **History**

Council currently has in place a contract for grounds maintenance at Airds, Claymore, Glenfield and Macquarie Fields which is due to expire on 29 February 2016. As Council continues to utilise these services and the contract expenditure historically exceeds the legislative threshold of \$150,000, Council invited tenders for a new contract. Council further identified this need extends to the suburb of Minto, and took the opportunity to include Minto in the Request for Tender specification.

#### **Report**

##### **Legislation**

This tender process was conducted in accordance with the *Local Government Act 1993*, the *Local Government (General) Regulation 2005* and Council's Procurement Policy and Procedures.

##### **Contract Expenditure**

Funds for these works are allocated in Council's budget.

---

**Contract Term**

The term for this contract will be for a period of two years with three options for extension of 12 months each.

**Advertising of Tenders**

Tenders were advertised in The Sydney Morning Herald, The Macarthur Advertiser and The Macarthur Chronicle in the weeks commencing 2 and 9 November 2015. Tenders were also advertised on Tenderlink and Council's website. The Ingleburn and Campbelltown Chambers of Commerce and Industry were notified.

**Tender Document**

Organisations were requested to submit the following information with their tender response:

- company details
- references
- company experience, particularly as they relate to these services, including details of the management staff/supervisor who is proposed to oversee the works
- details of any subcontractors and their experience, particularly as they relate to the services
- specifications of all plant and equipment proposed to be utilised (including back-up machinery)
- pricing
- insurances
- environmental practices
- Work Health and Safety management systems
- conflict of interest declaration
- collusive submission declaration
- additional terms of contract, if proposed.

**Tenders Received**

Tenders closed on Tuesday 1 December 2015. Twelve on-time responses were received from the following organisations:

- Better Safe Pest & Weed Management Pty Ltd
  - BNE Lawn & Garden Maintenance Pty Ltd
  - C.J. Murphy Tree Recycling Services Pty Ltd
  - Garden Growing Solutions Pty Ltd
  - GLG GreenLife Group Pty Ltd t/as GLG GreenLife Group
  - ILC Group Pty Ltd
  - Luke Magro t/as Lawn Mowing & Gardening Service
  - New Link Pty Ltd
  - Skyline Landscape Services Pty Ltd
  - Snippers Lawnmowing Maintenance Service & Sales Pty Ltd t/as Snippers Lawnmowing
  - Steamwand International Pty Ltd t/as Weedtechnics
  - Waratah Lawncare and Garden Management Pty Ltd t/as Waratah Lawncare & Garden Management.
-

### **Evaluation Process**

The Evaluation Panel, consisting of officers from Operational Services and Waste & Recycling Services evaluated the tenders against the following weighted assessment criteria:

- Experience of the company and subcontracting
- Specifications of equipment
- Price
- Work health and safety
- Environmental commitment.

The Evaluation Panel used Council's standard 0-10 scoring system for all non-pricing criteria with 10 being the highest score.

The Work Health and Safety and Environmental Practices criteria were assessed on the basis of unsatisfactory, satisfactory or exceptional.

The scoring of tendered prices was determined on a per service per suburb basis.

The Evaluation Panel decided prior to advertising that each suburb would be evaluated and awarded separately.

### **Recommendation of the Evaluation Panel**

GLG Greenlife Group Pty Ltd t/as GLG Greenlife Group provided the best response to Council for the grounds maintenance in the suburbs, Claymore, Glenfield and Macquarie Fields and is recommended as they:

- provided satisfactory details of their company experience, particularly as they relate to the services, confirmed through reference checks
- provided satisfactory details of their equipment specifications
- tendered a competitive per service price to Council
- provided satisfactory work, health, safety and environmental documentation.

Skyline Landscape Services Pty Ltd provided the best response to Council for the grounds maintenance in the suburbs Airds and Minto and is recommended as they:

- provided satisfactory details of their company experience, particularly as they relate to the services, confirmed through reference checks
- provided satisfactory details of their equipment specifications
- tendered a competitive per service price to Council;
- provided satisfactory works, health, safety and environmental documentation.

### **Tenders Not Recommended for the Grounds Maintenance in Airds**

The following tenders were not recommended for grounds maintenance in the suburb of Airds as they tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer and the Evaluation Panel did not consider there to be any additional benefit for the increased price:

- Better Safe Pest & Weed Management Pty Ltd
  - BNE Lawn & Garden Maintenance Pty Ltd
-



### 3.3 T15/28 Grounds Maintenance At Airds, Claymore, Glenfield, Macquarie Fields And Minto

---

- C.J. Murphy Tree Recycling Services Pty Ltd
- Garden Growing Solutions Pty Ltd
- GLG GreenLife Group Pty Ltd t/as GLG GreenLife Group
- ILC Group Pty Ltd
- Luke Magro t/as Lawn Mowing & Gardening Service
- New Link Pty Ltd
- Snippers Lawnmowing Maintenance Service & Sales Pty Ltd t/as Snippers Lawnmowing
- Steamwand International Pty Ltd t/as Weedtechnics
- Waratah Lawncare and Garden Management Pty Ltd t/as Waratah Lawncare & Garden Management.

#### **Tenders Not Recommended for the Grounds Maintenance in Claymore**

The following tenders were not recommended for grounds maintenance in the suburb of Claymore as they tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer and the Evaluation Panel did not consider there to be any additional benefit for the increased price:

- BNE Lawn & Garden Maintenance Pty Ltd
- C.J. Murphy Tree Recycling Services Pty Ltd
- Garden Growing Solutions Pty Ltd
- ILC Group Pty Ltd
- Luke Magro t/as Lawn Mowing & Gardening Service
- New Link Pty Ltd
- Skyline Landscape Services Pty Ltd
- Snippers Lawnmowing Maintenance Service & Sales Pty Ltd t/as Snippers Lawnmowing
- Steamwand International Pty Ltd t/as Weedtechnics
- Waratah Lawncare and Garden Management Pty Ltd t/as Waratah Lawncare & Garden Management.

Better Safe Pest & Weed Management Pty Ltd are not recommended for grounds maintenance in the suburb of Claymore as they did not provide sufficient detail to demonstrate their experience in similar works and capacity to meet Council's requirements.

#### **Tenders Not Recommended for the Grounds Maintenance in Glenfield**

The following tenders were not recommended for grounds maintenance in the suburb of Glenfield as they tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer and the Evaluation Panel did not consider there to be any additional benefit for the increased price:

- Better Safe Pest & Weed Management Pty Ltd
  - BNE Lawn & Garden Maintenance Pty Ltd
  - C.J. Murphy Tree Recycling Services Pty Ltd
  - Garden Growing Solutions Pty Ltd
  - ILC Group Pty Ltd
  - Luke Magro t/as Lawn Mowing & Gardening Service
  - New Link Pty Ltd
  - Skyline Landscape Services Pty Ltd
  - Snippers Lawnmowing Maintenance Service & Sales Pty Ltd t/as Snippers Lawnmowing
  - Steamwand International Pty Ltd t/as Weedtechnics
  - Waratah Lawncare and Garden Management Pty Ltd t/as Waratah Lawncare & Garden Management.
-

**Tenders Not Recommended for the Grounds Maintenance in Macquarie Fields**

The following tenders were not recommended for grounds maintenance in the suburb of Macquarie Fields as they tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer and the Evaluation Panel did not consider there to be any additional benefit for the increased price:

- Better Safe Pest & Weed Management Pty Ltd
- BNE Lawn & Garden Maintenance Pty Ltd
- C.J. Murphy Tree Recycling Services Pty Ltd
- Garden Growing Solutions Pty Ltd
- ILC Group Pty Ltd
- Luke Magro t/as Lawn Mowing & Gardening Service
- New Link Pty Ltd
- Skyline Landscape Services Pty Ltd
- Snippers Lawnmowing Maintenance Service & Sales Pty Ltd t/as Snippers Lawnmowing
- Steamwand International Pty Ltd t/as Weedtechnics
- Waratah Lawncare and Garden Management Pty Ltd t/as Waratah Lawncare & Garden Management.

**Tenders Not Recommended for the Grounds Maintenance in Minto**

The following tenders were not recommended for grounds maintenance in the suburb of Minto as they tendered a more expensive price than the recommended tenderer and the Evaluation Panel did not consider there to be any additional benefit for the increased price:

- Better Safe Pest & Weed Management Pty Ltd
- BNE Lawn & Garden Maintenance Pty Ltd
- C.J. Murphy Tree Recycling Services Pty Ltd
- Garden Growing Solutions Pty Ltd
- GLG GreenLife Group Pty Ltd t/as GLG GreenLife Group
- ILC Group Pty Ltd
- Luke Magro t/as Lawn Mowing & Gardening Service
- New Link Pty Ltd
- Snippers Lawnmowing Maintenance Service & Sales Pty Ltd t/as Snippers Lawnmowing
- Steamwand International Pty Ltd t/as Weedtechnics
- Waratah Lawncare and Garden Management Pty Ltd t/as Waratah Lawncare & Garden Management.

**Assurance of the Process Undertaken**

In accordance with Council's Procurement Procedures, a Tender Review Panel, consisting of members of Council's Executive reviewed the Tender to assure the process was undertaken in a manner that was fair, transparent and resulted in the best value outcome to Council.

---

### **Management of Proposed Contract**

The Contractor will be subject to contract management and safety reviews throughout the duration of the contract in accordance with Council's contract management requirements.

### **Officer's Recommendation**

1. That Council accept the offer of GLG GreenLife Group Pty Ltd t/as GLG GreenLife Group for the provision of grounds maintenance at Claymore, Glenfield and Macquarie Fields for a period of two years with three options for extension of 12 months each.
2. That Council accept the offer of Skyline Landscape Services Pty Ltd for the provision of grounds maintenance at Airds and Minto for a period of two years with three options for extension of 12 months each.
3. That the Contract documents be executed under the Common Seal of Council.
4. That the unsuccessful Tenderers be notified of the results of tender process.

### **Committee's Recommendation: (Glynn/Lake)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

### **CARRIED**

### **Council Meeting 16 February 2016 (Mead/Lake)**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

### **Council Resolution Minute Number 13**

That the Officer's Recommendation be adopted.

---

#### **4. EMERGENCY SERVICES**

**No reports this round**

#### **5. GENERAL BUSINESS**

Nil.

#### **Confidentiality Motion: (Glynn/Brticevic)**

That the Committee in accordance with Section 10A of the *Local Government Act 1993*, move to exclude the public from the meeting during discussions on the items in the Confidential Agenda, due to the confidential nature of the business and the Committee's opinion that the public proceedings of the Committee would be prejudicial to the public interest.

**CARRIED**

#### **22. CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS**

##### **22.1 Confidential Report Directors of Companies - City Works**

#### **Reason for Confidentiality**

This report is **CONFIDENTIAL** in accordance with Section 10A(2)(c) of the *Local Government Act 1993*, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: -

- (c) information that would, if disclosed, confer a commercial advantage on a person with whom the council is conducting (or proposes to conduct) business

#### **Motion: (Lake/Glynn)**

That the Committee in accordance with Section 10 of the *Local Government Act 1993*, move to re-open the meeting to the public.

**CARRIED**

There being no further business the meeting closed at 7.43pm.

C Mead  
CHAIRPERSON

---